Parliamentary Paper No. 373

General Purpose Standing Committee No 4

Budget Estimates 2000-2001

Volume 1

Ordered to be printed 23 June 2000

How to contact the Committee

Members of General Purpose Standing Committee No 4 can be contacted through the committee secretariat. Written correspondence and inquiries should be directed to:

The Director		
General Purpose Standing Committees		
Legislative Council		
Parliament House, Macquarie Street		
Sydney NSW 2000		
Email gpscno4@parliament.nsw.gov.au		
Telephone 61-2-9230 3544		
Facsimile 61-2-9230 3416		
Website www.parliament.nsw.gov.au		

ISBN 0-7347-6419-7

Terms of Reference¹

- 1. That the Budget Estimates and related documents presenting the amounts to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund be referred to the General Purpose Standing Committees for inquiry and report.
- 2. That the Committees consider the Budget Estimates in accordance with the allocation of portfolios to the Committees.
- 3. For the purposes of this inquiry any Member of the House may attend a meeting of a Committee in relation to the Budget Estimates and question witnesses, participate in the deliberations of the Committee at such meeting and make a dissenting statement relating to the Budget Estimates, but may not vote or be counted for the purpose of any quorum.
- 4. The Committees must hear evidence on the Budget Estimates in public.
- 5. Not more than 3 Committees are to hear evidence on the Budget Estimates simultaneously.
- 6. When a Committee hears evidence on the Budget Estimates, the Chair is to call on items of expenditure in the order decided on and declare the proposed expenditure open for examination.
- 7. The Committees may ask for explanations from Ministers in the House, or officers of departments, statutory bodies or corporations, relating to the items of proposed expenditure.
- 8. The report of a Committee on the Budget Estimates may propose the further consideration of any items.
- 9. A daily Hansard record of the hearings of a Committee on the Budget Estimates is to be published as soon as practicable after each day's proceedings.
- 10. The Committees have leave to sit during the sittings or any adjournment of the House.
- 11. After a Committee has considered proposed expenditure referred to it by the House and agreed to its report to the House, the Committee must fix:
 - (a) a day for the submission to the Committee of any written answers or additional information relating to the proposed expenditure, and
 - (b) a day for the commencement of supplementary meetings of the Committee to consider matters relating to the proposed expenditure, which day must be not less than 10 days after the day fixed under subparagraph (a).

¹ Legislative Council Minutes of the Proceedings, No.41, 23 May 2000, items 16, 19 and 20.

- 12. (1) A Member may lodge with a Committee, not less than 3 working days before the day fixed under subparagraph (11) (b), notice of matters relating to the written answers or additional information, or otherwise relating to the proposed expenditure referred to the committee, which the Member wishes to raise at the supplementary meetings of the Committee.
 - (2) Any notice lodged with a Committee must be forwarded by the Committee to the Minister in the House responsible for the matters to which the notice relates.
- 13. A Committee may determine at any time the number and duration of any supplementary meetings.
- 14. At a supplementary meeting, questions may be put to Ministers or officers of departments, statutory bodies or corporations, relating to matters of which notice has been given, and the proceedings of the Committee must be confined to those matters.
- 15. A Committee may report to the House any recommendation for further action by the House arising from the Committee's supplementary meetings.
- 16. Written questions relating to the Budget Estimates may be supplied to the Clerk of the Committee, who must distribute them to the relevant Minister and to Members of the Committee. Answers must be supplied to, and circulated by, the Clerk.
- 17. The Committees must:
 - (a) present a first report to the House before the House adjourns for the winter recess, and
 - (b) present a final report to the House by the first sitting day in August 2000.

Committee Membership

The Hon Jenny Gardiner MLC, *Chair* National Party

The Hon Ian Cohen MLC, Deputy Chair The Greens

The Hon John Hatzistergos MLC Australian Labor Party

The Hon Charlie Lynn MLC Liberal Party

The Hon Ian Macdonald MLC Australian Labor Party

The Hon David Oldfield MLC Pauline Hanson's One Nation

The Hon Janelle Saffin MLC Australian Labor Party

Other Members who attended the hearings

The Hon Richard Bull MLC National Party The Hon Jan Burnswoods MLC Australian Labor Party The Hon Ron Dyer MLC Australian Labor Party The Hon John Hannaford MLC

Liberal Party

The Hon Don Harwin MLC Liberal Party

The Hon John Jobling MLC Liberal Party

The Hon John Johnson MLC Australian Labor Party

The Hon Andrew Manson MLC Australian Labor Party

The Hon Dr Brian Pezzutti MLC Liberal Party

The Hon Peter Primrose MLC Australian Labor Party

Table of Contents

	Chairman's Foreword	ix
	Introduction	1
	Establishment of the General Purpose Standing Committees	1
	Portfolios	1
	Powers of the General Purpose Standing Committees	2
	Referral of the Budget Estimates	3
Chapter 1	Urban Affairs and Planning, Aboriginal Affairs, Housing	4
	Urban Affairs and Planning	4
	Aboriginal Affairs	5
	Housing	6
Chapter 2	Gaming and Racing	8
Chapter 3	Transport, Roads	13
	Transport	13
	Roads	16
Chapter 4	Public Works and Services	18
Chapter 5	Administrative matters	21
Appendix 1	Documents tabled at the hearings	23
	Proceedings of the Committee	25

Chair's Foreword

General Purpose Standing Committee No 4 has examined the Budget Estimates for 2000-2001 for the portfolio areas of:

Urban Affairs and Planning, Aboriginal Affairs, Housing

Gaming and Racing

Transport, Roads

Public Works and Services

In this first report on the 2000-2001 Estimates, the Committee summarises a number of specific matters relating to the various portfolio areas which were the subject of questions to Ministers, as well as departmental and agency officers, at public hearings held on 6, 7, 9 and 19 June 2000.

The Committee, in addition to considering answers to questions on notice still to be received, will hold further hearings focusing on the operations of Star City Casino before tabling a further report in August 2000.

The Committee expresses its appreciation to Ministers and officers of the departments and organisations who appeared before it.

The Hon Jenny Gardiner MLC Chair

Introduction

Establishment of the General Purpose Standing Committees

The five General Purpose Standing Committees were first constituted by resolution of the Legislative Council on 7 May 1997, during the 51st Parliament.² On 13 May 1999, shortly after the commencement of the 52nd Parliament, the five committees were reconstituted.³

The General Purpose Standing Committees may inquire and report on:

- (a) any matters referred to them by the House;
- (b) the expenditure, performance or effectiveness of any department of government, statutory body or corporation;
- (c) any matter in any annual report of a department of government, statutory body or corporation.⁴

Portfolios

The Legislature

The five committees reflect the Government Minister's portfolios as follows:

Committee No 1	Committee No 2	
Premiers, Arts and Citizenship	Health	
Treasury, State Development	Community Services, Ageing, Disability Services, Women	
Olympics Education and Training	Small Business, Tourism	
	Mineral Resources, Fisheries	
Special Minister of State		

² Minutes of Proceedings, No 65, 7 May 1997, p677. Also see Minutes of Proceedings, No 4, 14 September 1999, p48, for amendment to the resolution (the addition of Special Minister of State to the portfolio areas). 3 Minutes of Proceedings, No 3, 13 May 1999, p62 (hereafter referred to as Resolution of 13 May 1999). 4 Resolution of 13 May 1999, para 3.

Committee No 3

Police

Attorney General, Industrial Relations

Fair Trading, Sport and Recreation

Juvenile Justice, Youth

Committee No 4

Urban Affairs and Planning, Aboriginal Affairs, Housing

Transport, Road

Gaming and Racing, Hunter Development

Public Works and Services

Committee No 5

Information Technology, Energy, Forestry, Western Sydney

Agriculture, Land and Water Conservation

Environment, Emergency Services, Corrective Services

Local Government, Regional Development, Rural Affairs

Powers of the General Purpose Standing Committees

The General Purpose Standing Committees have power:

- (a) to send for and examine persons, papers, records and things;
- (b) to adjourn from place to place;
- (c) to make visits of inspection within the State;
- (d) to request the attendance of and examine Members of the House;
- (e) to publish, before presentation to the House, submissions received and evidence taken in public; and
- (f) to report from time to time their proceedings, evidence taken in public and recommendations.⁵

⁵ Resolution of 13 May 1999, para 8.

Referral of the 2000-2001 Budget Estimates

On 23 May 2000, the Legislative Council resolved that the Budget Estimates and related documents presenting the amounts to be appropriated from the Consolidated Funds be referred to the General Purpose Standing Committees for inquiry and report.⁶ Each Committee is to examine the Budget Estimates for their relevant portfolios and present a first report to the House before the House adjourns for the winter recess, and present a final report to the House by the first sitting day in August 2000.⁷

Under the resolution there is no requirement for the Committees' consideration of the Budget Estimates to be completed prior to the passage of the 2000-2001 Appropriation Bills. Separation of consideration of the Budget Estimates from the passage of the Appropriation Bills provides greater flexibility for the Committees to scrutinise government expenditure. Under section 5A of the Constitution Act 1902 the Legislative Council is not able to prevent the passage of Bills appropriating money for the ordinary annual services of the Government.

3

⁶ Minutes of Proceedings, No 41, 23 May 2000, items 16, 19 and 20 (hereafter referred to as Resolution of 23 May 2000). 7 Resolution of 23 May 2000, para 17.

Chapter 1 Urban Affairs and Planning, Aboriginal Affairs, Housing

The Committee heard evidence from the Hon Dr Andrew Refshauge MP, Minister for Urban Affairs and Planning, Minister for Aboriginal Affairs, and Minister for Housing, and Ms Sue Holliday, Director General, Department of Urban Affairs and Planning, at a public hearing a held on 6 June 2000. A brief summary of issues discussed at the hearing is provided below.

Urban Affairs and Planning

Ministerial Development Corporation

1.1 The Minister answered questions about the role of the Ministerial Development Corporation.

Coastal Council

1.2 The Minister gave evidence concerning the role of the Coastal Council and the status of coastal policy.

Land acquisition

1.3 The Minister answered questions concerning the funds available for land acquisition and the identification of areas for acquisition.

Planning expenditure

1.4 The Minister explained items of expenditure relating to regional planning, sustainable development, and planning systems.

New planning projects

1.5 The Minister provided information on seven new planning projects, four in regional New South Wales and three in metropolitan Sydney.

Urban sustainability

1.6 The Minister answered questions concerning community participation and staff training in urban sustainability.

Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority

1.7 The Minister was questioned about the Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority, with particular reference to the Chairman of the Authority.

Australian Defence Industries site

1.8 The Minister was questioned in relation to funding and planning for the Australian Defence Industries site at St Mary's.

Consultant expenditure

1.9 The Minister provided details of the total amount spent by the Department of Urban Affairs and Planning on consultants in 1999-2000 and the projected expenditure for 2000-2001.

Staff travel

1.10 The Minister provided details of overseas travel undertaken by Department of Urban Affairs and Planning staff in 1999-2000. The Minister undertook to provide further details on the class of travel and the total cost of each trip.

Heritage Office

1.11 The Minister stated that there will be a review of the heritage grants program and the general grants program will not be followed this coming financial year.

Miscellaneous

1.12 Other issues raised included: control of the Museum of Contemporary Art building; legal costs incurred by the Department of Urban Affairs and Planning; community participation in regional planning; allocations for the Illawarra escarpment; payment to external agencies for review of State Environmental Planning Policy 1.

Aboriginal Affairs

Aboriginal Communities Development program

1.13 The Minister gave evidence concerning funds allocated to the Aboriginal Communities Development program, and projects funded under the program.

Provision of dwellings

1.14 The Minister answered questions about the number of dwellings to be provided for rural and aboriginal housing, and undertook to provide further details about private rental subsidies for Aboriginal housing.

Miscellaneous

1.15 Other issues raised included: funding for Aboriginal welfare groups visiting prisons; employment opportunities for Aboriginal people in Aboriginal housing; and support for native title claimants.

Housing

Sale of public housing

1.16 The Minister was questioned in relation to the sale of public housing stock and the security of tenure for people wanting to remain in a particular community. The Minister explained that while there was no absolute guarantee every effort was made to keep people in the geographical area of their choice.

Public housing waiting lists

1.17 The Minister was questioned about the waiting list for public housing, including the waiting list for priority housing in the current year compared to previous years, and forecasts of the number of applicants for public housing in future years.

Community housing

1.18 The growth of community housing was discussed.

Vacant public housing

1.19 The Minister answered questions about public housing vacancies.

Miscellaneous

1.20 Other issues raised included: protection of boarders and lodgers with housing priority needs; and public housing on the Airds estate.

Minister's office

Ministerial overseas travel

1.21 The Minister provided details of his overseas travel for the financial year 1999-2000.

Chapter 2 Gaming and Racing

The Committee heard evidence from the Hon Richard Face MLC, Minister for Gaming and Racing, together with Mr Ken Brown, Director-General, Department of Gaming and Racing, and Ms Jill Hennessy, Director, Policy and Development Division, Department of Gaming and Racing, at a public hearing held on 7 June 2000. The Committee heard evidence from Mr Brown and Mr Michael Foggo, Director, Revenue and Resource Management, Department of Gaming and Racing, at an additional public hearing held on 19 June 2000. A brief summary of issues discussed at the hearings is provided below. During the course of the hearings three documents were tabled. A list of these documents is provided at Appendix 1.

7 June 2000

Staffing reductions in gaming compliance

2.1 The Minister answered questions concerning the reduction in average staffing levels in gaming compliance, and the sufficiency of the number of compliance inspectors.

Staff reductions in casino surveillance

2.2 The Minister discussed the impact of staff reductions in the Casino Surveillance Division and key activities of the inspection and audit branches.

Casino Community Benefit Fund

2.3 The Minister gave evidence concerning continuity of funding from the Casino Community Benefit Fund, and the services and projects supported by the Fund. Ms Hennessy gave evidence as to the basis for determining the level of allocation for individual services, including the calculation of treatment costs per client.

Casino surveillance incident reporting

2.4 Mr Brown answered questions concerning procedures in the Casino Surveillance Division relating to reports by inspectors of incidents and complaints.

Money laundering through Sydney casino

2.5 Mr Brown gave evidence in relation to the role of the Casino Surveillance Division in cases of suspected money laundering; the exclusion of individuals from the Casino due to money laundering concerns; responsibility for oversighting the effectiveness of the Casino

Surveillance Division in relation to money laundering; and staff and budget cuts affecting the Casino Surveillance Division.

Greyhound racing industry

2.6 The Committee heard evidence in relation to dog drugging charges laid by the Greyhound Racing Authority (GRA); the role of whistleblowers in connection with recent investigations of alleged corruption in the industry; the dismissal of the GRA board; and new drug testing initiatives.

Inquiry concerning casino surveillance

2.7 The Minister answered questions concerning the possibility of conflicts of interest arising in the inquiry into the operations of the Casino Surveillance Division.

Reports of illegal activity at Casino

2.8 Mr Brown answered questions concerning possible illegal activity at the Casino other than money laundering, and the barring of patrons.

19 June 2000

Casino Surveillance and Casino Control Authority witnesses

2.9 The Committee discussed the need to call the Director of Casino Surveillance and representatives of the Casino Control Authority.

Departmental employees

2.10 In response to a request for a list of employees of the Department of Gaming and Racing, Mr Brown undertook to provide the Committee with a copy of the Department's telephone directory by the close of business on 20 June 2000. Mr Brown honoured that commitment.

Transfer of surplus running rail from Goulburn racecourse to Rylstone racecourse

2.11 Mr Brown provided information about the problems associated with the transfer of surplus running rail from Goulburn racecourse to Rylstone racecourse. Mr Brown undertook to provide the Committee with information about the cost of the running rail.

Liquor Amendment Responsible Gambling Regulation

2.12 Mr Brown indicated that a number of representations had been made to the government expressing concerns about the impact of the proposed Liquor Amendment Responsible

Gambling Regulation on country communities, particularly with reference to the proposed ban on the cashing of cheques at hotels.

Internet access for departmental officers

2.13 Mr Foggo answered a question about access to the internet by departmental employees. Mr Foggo complied with a request from the Committee that he provide a copy of the Departmental Communication Policy to the Committee.

Revesby Workers Club

2.14 The Committee noted that the Revesby Workers Club had received the Club of the Year award. Mr Brown undertook to provide the Committee with information about the objects of the Revesby Workers Club.

Casino Surveillance Division budget

- **2.15** Mr Brown told the Committee that a decision to reduce the budget of the Casino Surveillance Division by \$1.75 million was conveyed to the department by Treasury, and that the total expenses for casino surveillance are currently \$3.804 million.
- **2.16** Mr Brown also provided the Committee with information about a budget-related recommendation that the Director of Casino Surveillance move to a risk-based monitoring program arising out of a performance audit completed by the Auditor-General in June 1998.

Video surveillance at the Casino

2.17 A series of questions were asked about video surveillance at the Casino, and resources available to monitor video footage. Mr Brown undertook to provide the Committee with information about how long video footage is retained.

Casino Surveillance Division incident reports

- **2.18** Mr Brown provided information about the number of incident reports generated by the Casino Surveillance Division, but stated he was unable to provide detail about the content of these reports as he is not privy to this information and it is covered by secrecy provisions.
- **2.19** Mr Brown advised the Committee that he had directed the Director of Casino Surveillance to implement a system to regularly assess incident reports and record in writing any action to be taken in relation to an incident.

Exclusion orders under section 81 of the Casino Control Act 1992

2.20 In response to questioning, Mr Brown provided information about persons excluded from the casino on the direction of the Minister for Police.

Illegal activity within the casino

2.21 Mr Brown advised the Committee that the casino operator is required, by virtue of the casino license, to ensure that criminal influence and activity is not operating within the casino.

Inquiry into the operation of the casino

- **2.22** A number of questions were asked about the section 31 inquiry into the operation of the casino being conducted by Mr Peter McClellan. Mr Brown explained the legislative basis of the inquiry, and provided information about matters being considered by Mr McClellan. Mr Brown undertook to provide the Committee with information about those people involved in the inquiries being conducted under sections 31 and 143.
- **2.23** Mr Brown informed the Committee that Mr Mark Duggan, a departmental employee who had been seconded to work on the inquiry, has sought and been granted a release from his secondment.

Sexual harassment of casino employees by casino patrons

2.24 Mr Brown responded to questions about whether employees at the casino had been subject to sexual harassment by casino patrons.

Provision of services to intoxicated patrons at the casino

2.25 Committee Members asked a number of questions about the provision of services to intoxicated patrons at the casino.

Casino Community Benefit Fund

2.26 Mr Brown undertook to provide the Committee with information about the distribution of money from the Casino Community Fund.

Inspectors as witnesses

2.27 The Chair questioned Mr Brown as to whether he would have difficulty were the Committee to select a batch of inspectors to appear before it. Mr Brown stated he had no objection and acknowledged he had no power no object.

Problem gamblers

2.28 Mr Brown was questioned about the liability of the casino arising out of legislation relating to problem gamblers. Mr Brown undertook to advise the Committee as to whether there are any "G-line" signs in the high rollers room at the casino.

Debts to the casino

2.29 Mr Brown undertook to provide the Committee with information about advice provided to the Minister relating to debts owed to the casino.

Personal safety of the Minister and departmental staff

2.30 Mr Brown indicated he had not advised the Minister about personal safety, and had not been personally notified of personal safety concerns by any departmental officer.

Improper offers

2.31 A number of questions were asked about whether departmental officers, or the Minister, had received any threats, bribes or improper offers. Mr Brown told the Committee that the department has a code of conduct which clearly enunciates what is appropriate and what is not.

Staff reporting of criminal activities

2.32 Mr Brown was questioned about what directives had been issued to staff about reporting of criminal activities.

Gaming and Liquor Commission

2.33 The Committee noted that on 22 September 1999 the Minister stated that a report would be delivered to Cabinet from a whole-of-government committee regarding the establishment of a Gaming and Liquor Commission. Mr Brown said this was a matter of government policy and was under the auspices of the Premier. He suggested questions about progress in relation to the matter be directed to the Premier.

Chapter 3 Transport, Roads

The Committee heard evidence from the Hon Carl Scully MP, Minister for Transport and Minister for Roads, together with Mr Ron Christie, Coordinator-General, Mr Simon Lane, Chief Executive Officer, State Rail Authority, Mr Rob Noyes, Chief Financial Officer, State Rail Authority, Mr Terry Ogg, Chief Executive Officer, Rail Services Australia, and Mr Jock Murray, Director-General, Department of Transport, at a public hearing held on 7 June 2000. The Committee also heard evidence from Mr Christie, Mr Peter Scarlett, Director, Finance, Roads and Traffic Authority, Mr Paul Hayes, Acting Deputy Director-General, Department of Transport, Mr Paul Forward, Chief Executive, Roads and Traffic Authority, and Mr Matthew Taylor, Chief Executive Officer, Waterways Authority, at an additional public hearing held on 19 June 2000. A brief summary of issues discussed at the hearings is provided below.

Transport (7 June 2000)

Coordinator-General of Rail

3.1 The appointment of the Coordinator-General of Rail was discussed. The Minister indicated that the pay and conditions attaching to this appointment had not been settled, and that no determination had yet been made concerning performance criteria. Other issues examined included the rationale for the decision to give the Coordinator-General authority over the boards of the three rail agencies, and the future role of the Public Transport Authority.

Fare-free day

3.2 The Committee sought information concerning the fare-free day held on 31 May 2000. Matters discussed included the estimated cost of the initiative; the justification for the decision to proceed with the event; ticketing problems encountered; how those problems were dealt with; and revenue loss to State Rail from the sale of discounted periodic passes.

Funding for rail services

3.3 The Committee questioned witnesses about sources of additional revenue expected to offset reductions in funding for the State Rail Authority; and the Purchase of Public Transport Services program.

Rural transport services

3.4 The Minister answered questions regarding spending on rural rail services, and the need for improvements in public transport for the North Coast. In particular, the Minister indicated he would be prepared to consider options for local bus or train services on the North Coast if such options exist, including revitalising rail services in the Lismore area.

Rail maintenance and safety standards

3.5 The Committee examined witnesses concerning the adequacy of funds available for the improvement of maintenance standards in the rail system; redundancies in maintenance staff; and the impact of redundancies on maintenance standards and safety.

Millennium train carriages

3.6 The Minister provided information concerning the schedule for the addition of new Millennium train carriages, and plans for the existing Tulloch trailer carriages.

Signal maintenance

3.7 Mr Ogg was examined in relation to a ministerial directive regarding 24 hour signal maintenance coverage of main rail junctions; proposals to reduce shifts and staff allocated to the Sydenham emergency mobile unit ("Sydenham Z-car"); and the possibility of conflict between such a reduction and the ministerial directive and other rules.

Security cameras

3.8 The Committee questioned witnesses about the implementation of the security camera upgrade initiative for railway stations, including delays to the project, and the expected associated costs.

Renovation work at Central Station

3.9 Evidence was provided as to delays in the schedule for the renovation work at Central Station, and the provision of extra funds to deal with the delays.

School Student Transport Scheme

3.10 Evidence was provided in relation to funds allocated to the School Student Transport Scheme; the method of calculating subsidies to private bus operators; and the auditing of funded services.

Liverpool to Parramatta Transitway

3.11 The Minister answered questions concerning progress in the construction of the Liverpool to Parramatta Transitway, whether the project was covered by an Environmental Impact Statement, and the degree of patronage of similar transitways elsewhere.

Senior executives' performance and bonuses

3.12 Mr Lane and Mr Ogg answered questions regarding their performance criteria and bonuses. The Minister agreed, subject to advice concerning commercial-in-confidence, to table the

performance agreements of Mr Murray, Mr Lane, Mr Cowling, Mr Ogg and Mr Stott, and to inform the Committee in each case whether bonuses had been paid for 1998-99.

Miscellaneous

3.13 The following matters were also raised: revenue from retained taxes, fees and fines; the implementation of self-regulation by the private sector in transport services; the Public Transport Infrastructure Improvement Fund program; and the Parramatta to Chatswood rail link.

Transport (19 June 2000)

Rail delays

3.14 Mr Christie answered questions concerning delays in the rail system on 15 June 2000, and contingency plans for handling such incidents.

Transport concessions

3.15 Mr Hayes gave evidence concerning the extension of public transport concessions.

Taxi and hire care industries reform

3.16 Mr Hayes gave evidence about the background to planned reforms in the taxi and hire car industries, and agreed to provide the Committee with details of the proposed reforms and the anticipated costs.

Olympics preparations

3.17 Mr Taylor gave evidence about the Waterways Authority's preparations for the Olympics.

Miscellaneous

3.18 Other issues raised included: the Manly JetCat service; North and Western Bus Lines; appointment of Ms Kathy Jones; reduction of pensioner seats on rail services; possible compensation claims arising from outsourcing of railway maintenance; quarterly customer services of CityRail; customer charter for CityRail and CountryLink; integrated ticketing; and extension of central business district light rail.

Roads (19 June 2000)

Bridges

3.19 Mr Forward answered questions concerning the Corowa, Euston, and Moama bridges on the Murray River, the Mundadoo bridge in the Warren shire, and the Country Timber Bridges program.

M5 East

3.20 Mr Forward answered questions concerning budgeting for the M5 East project including funding for analysis of alternative technology.

RTA staffing

3.21 Mr Forward was questioned about details of average staffing for the Roads and Traffic Authority across programs.

Environmental impact of road projects

3.22 Mr Forward responded to questions about noise treatment measures along Abbott Road and the assessment of environmental factors in road projects.

Boral road

3.23 Mr Forward was questioned in relation to plans by Boral to create a road through its quarry at Wetherill Park

Bus and transit lanes

3.24 Mr Forward answered questions concerning extensions of bus and transit lanes.

Tunnel ventilation workshop

3.25 Mr Forward provided information about the cost of the recent international workshop on tunnel ventilation, public access to the workshop, and the results of the initiative.

Impact of roads spending

3.26 Mr Forward was questioned about assessment of the environmental and health impact of proposed spending on roads in western Sydney.

Tolls

3.27 Mr Forward responded to questions about the introduction of a universal tolling system, and the option of a toll on the F3.

Single invitation contract system

3.28 Mr Forward was questioned about the councils prequalified for the single invitation contract system for the repair of State roads.

Pacific Highway upgrade

3.29 Mr Forward answered questions about the Pacific Highway upgrade including the proportion of highway to be dual carriageway from Hexham to Queensland.

Heavy vehicle registration charges

3.30 Mr Forward answered questions about the indexation of heavy vehicle registration charges.

Fixed speed cameras

3.31 Mr Forward was questioned about the installation of fixed speed cameras in NSW and revenue from speeding fines.

Safetycams

3.32 Mr Forward was questioned about prosecutions and reports of traffic violations from the use of safetycams.

Miscellaneous

3.33 Other issues raised included: the heavy vehicle checking station at Marulan; the RTA computer system; and the property valuation unit at Lismore.

Chapter 4 Public Works and Services

The Committee heard evidence from Mr R Pearson, Director General, Mr A Renouf, Director, Executive Services Division, Mr K Page, Acting Manager, Corporate Finance, Mr A Collins, Group General Manger, Project Management Group, Mr D Lewis, Group General Manager, Corporate and Business Services Group, Mr E Smithies, Director, Policy Services Division, Mr I McFarlane, Cost Centre Manager, Country, State Valuation Office, Mr E Smith, Manager, Ministerial and Executive Support Unit, all of the Department of Public Works and Services, at a public hearing held on 9 June 2000. The Hon Morris Iemma MP, Minister for Public Works and Services advised the Committee he was unable to attend the hearing due to illness. A brief summary of issues discussed at the hearings is provided below.

Conservatorium of Music refurbishment

4.1 Mr Persson informed the Committee of the original and revised cost estimates for the refurbishment of the Conservatorium of Music, and of the reasons for the increases in those estimates.

Increased labour costs

4.2 Mr Collins outlined the impact of increased labour costs on public works projects in NSW. He agreed to provide a list of the projects affected by such increases indicating the nature of the impact in each case.

Risk Management and Policy program

4.3 Mr Persson outlined the projects to be funded under the grants to agencies item within the Risk Management and Policy Development program. He also gave a breakdown of the information services outlay and agreed to provide information concerning advertising of services and projects.

Hanging points in cells

4.4 The Committee asked a series of questions concerning the implementation of recommendations contained in the 1999 Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody report relating to hanging points in gaol and police cells. Mr Persson undertook to provide a comprehensive response.

E-commerce project

4.5 Mr Persson provided information about the e-commerce project and the expected associated benefits.

Recycled paper

4.6 Mr Persson was questioned concerning the use of recycled paper and related technology by government agencies.

Manly Hydraulics Laboratory

4.7 Mr Persson outlined some of the energy-efficient features of the design of the redevelopment of the Manly Hydraulics Laboratory. He undertook to provide details as to the effectiveness of the design in returning excess electricity to the grid.

Building refurbishments

4.8 Mr Persson outlined the refurbishments of government buildings which have taken place in the past year and those due for 2000-01.

Project risk management

4.9 Mr Persson described the Project Risk Management program and informed the Committee of the amount spent on Y2K management and risk avoidance.

New WorkCover building

4.10 Evidence was provided regarding the tender process for the new WorkCover building in Gosford, development approval for the building, and the development agreement.

Department of Local Government relocation

4.11 Mr Persson answered questions concerning the relocation of the Department of Local Government to Nowra.

Funding for prisons

4.12 Mr Persson undertook to provide the Committee with information about reasons for the increase in funding for Emu Plains prison, Goulburn maximum security prison, and the Parklea Remand Centre.

Voluntary redundancy program

4.13 Mr Persson outlined factors impacting on the implementation of the Department's voluntary redundancy program.

New management information system

4.14 Mr Persson informed the Committee that extensions of time had been necessary for the finalisation of the new management information system and the new completion date.

Miscellaneous

4.15 Other issues discussed included: conversion of the parliamentary precinct to dual-flush toilets and water-efficient showers; legal costs incurred in the action against British Telecom; review of properties for disposal potential; the completion of the security system contract for the Frank Baxter Justice Centre; and completion of the city improvement project.

Chapter 5 Administrative matters

Questions by Topic

5.1 During 1999 hearings into the Budget Estimates, the Committee allocated time for questions between the Opposition and Cross Bench members. This year, the Committee asked questions about a specific topic until questions from all members on that topic were exhausted, before proceeding on to a new topic. Members found this process allowed for more effective questioning of witnesses and recommends its use in future hearings.

Questions on notice

- **5.2** No questions were placed on notice prior to the public hearings.
- **5.3** The Committee set 16 June 2000 as the date by which the Minister for Urban Affairs and Planning, Aboriginal Affairs and Housing, should respond to questions placed on notice at, or after, the hearing held on 6 June 2000. Questions were forwarded to the Minister on 9 June 2000. The Minister has written to the Committee indicating it was not possible to meet the deadline of 16 June but that he hopes to be in a position to provide answers to the questions by 23 June 2000.

Supplementary hearings

- **5.4** The Committee has agreed to hold a supplementary hearing in relation to Gaming and Racing at a date to be determined, to hear evidence from the Director of Casino Surveillance, the Chief Executive of the Casino Control Authority, and the Chairperson of the Authority.
- **5.5** The Committee has not set a date for supplementary hearings for other portfolio areas at this stage.

Appendix 1 – Documents tabled at the hearings

Gaming and Racing

7 June 2000

Table, undated, listing organisations funded from the Casino Community Benefit Fund.

19 June 2000

Letter from the Minister's Chief of Staff to the Director of the Standing Committee on State Development, dated 16 June 2000, concerning availability of witnesses for the hearing.

Department of Gaming and Racing Communications Policy, undated.

Proceedings of the Committee

Minutes No. 7

Tuesday 6 June 2000 At Parliament House at 7.45 pm

1. Members Present

Ms Gardiner (in the Chair) Mr Cohen Mr Hatzistergos Mr Harwin (Lynn) Mr Macdonald Ms Saffin

2. Apologies

Mr Oldfield

3. Budget Estimates reference

The Chair advised that Mr Harwin would be representing Mr Lynn.

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Cohen, that the Chair inform the Minister that, if necessary, the Committee is prepared to extend the time for the hearing to allow any remaining questions to be asked.

The Committee agreed that the following allocations of time would be followed during the hearing, but that flexibility in the observance of those times would be allowed: Urban Affairs and Planning - 45 minutes; Housing – 45 minutes; Aboriginal Affairs – 30 minutes.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Cohen, that if the Minister is absent for a division the Committee will adjourn until he returns.

The Hon Dr A J Refshauge MP, Minister for Urban Affairs and Planning, Minister for Aboriginal Affairs, Minister for Housing, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisors:

Department of Urban Affairs and Planning

Sue Holliday, Director General Paul Campbell, Manager, Financial Services

Department of Housing

Andrew Cappie-Wood, Director General Wayne Brailey, Director, Finance

Department of Aboriginal Affairs

Andrew Cappie-Wood, Acting Director General

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Urban Affairs and Planning, Aboriginal Affairs and Housing open for examination.

The Minister and relevant advisors answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The Minister withdrew in order to attend a division.

The Committee adjourned.

The Committee resumed.

The Minister and relevant advisors continued to answer questions by Members of the Committee.

The examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Urban Affairs and Planning, Aboriginal Affairs and Housing concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public and media withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Macdonald:

- (a) That any additional written questions relating to the portfolio areas of Urban Affairs and Planning, Aboriginal Affairs, and Housing, be lodged with the Director of the General Purpose Standing Committees by 5.00 pm, Wednesday 7 June 2000.
- (b) That answers to written questions, including questions taken on notice at the hearing, relating to the portfolio areas of Urban Affairs and Planning, Aboriginal Affairs, and Housing, be lodged with the Director of the General Purpose Standing Committees by 16 June 2000.

4. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10.00 pm until 5.30pm on Wednesday, 7 June 2000.

Minutes No. 8

Wednesday 7 June 2000 At Parliament House at 5.30 pm

1. Members Present

Mr Cohen (in the Chair) Mr Bull (Gardiner) Mr Hannaford (Lynn) Mr Hatzistergos Mr Macdonald Mr Manson (Saffin) Mr Oldfield

2. Budget Estimates reference

The Deputy Chair advised that Mr Bull would be representing Ms Gardiner, Mr Hannaford would be representing Mr Lynn, and Mr Manson would be representing Ms Saffin.

The Deputy Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings

The Committee deliberated.

The Committee agreed that there would be no time limits on questioning for the hearing.

The Committee agreed that if the Minister is absent from the hearing for a division the Committee will continue to examine witnesses.

The Hon J. R. Face MP, Minister for Gaming and Racing, Minister Assisting the Premier on Hunter Development, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisors:

Department of Gaming and Racing

Mr K M Brown, Director-General Mr M Foggo, Director, Revenue and Resource Management Ms J Hennessy, Director, Policy and Development Mr P Baldwin, Acting Director, Offices of Racing and Charities Mr R McCann, Acting Directing, Compliance Division

Minister's staff

Mr J Anderson, Senior Policy Adviser Mr F Smidt, Media Liaison Officer

The public and media were admitted.

The Deputy Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on estimates.

The Deputy Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Gaming and Racing, Hunter Development, open for examination.

The Minister and relevant advisors answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Gaming and Racing, Hunter Development, concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The Minister tendered a document to support his evidence.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Hannaford, that the Committee accept the document tendered by the Minister.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Hannaford, that the document be incorporated in the transcript of proceedings.

The Minister and relevant advisors continued to answer questions by Members of the Committee.

The Deputy Chair advised the Minister that as the document tendered is voluminous it is not suitable for incorporation in the transcript of proceedings, and that the Committee would consider whether to authorise its publication at the deliberative meeting following the hearing.

The public and media withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Bull, that any additional written questions relating to the portfolio areas of Gaming and Racing, Hunter Development, be lodged with the Director of the General Purpose Standing Committees by midday, Friday 9 June 2000.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Hannaford, that the previous resolution resolving to incorporate a document which the Committee has identified as being unsuitable for incorporation, be rescinded.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Hannaford, that, under section 4 of the *Parliamentary Papers* (*Supplementary Provisions*) *Act 1975* and under the authority of Standing Order 252, the Committee authorises the Clerk of the Committee to publish the document tendered by the Minister.

3. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 7.40 pm until 8.00 pm on Wednesday 7 June 2000.

Minutes No. 9

Wednesday 7 June 2000 At Parliament House at 8.00 pm

1. Members Present

Ms Gardiner (in the Chair) Mr Cohen Mr Hatzistergos Mr Jobling (Lynn) Mr Macdonald Ms Saffin

2. Apologies

Mr Oldfield

3. Budget Estimates reference

The Chair advised that Mr Jobling would be representing Mr Lynn.

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Jobling, that if the Minister leaves the hearing to attend a division, Members will continue to question witnesses.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Jobling, that Members will question witnesses on specific issues rather than allocating blocks of time to individual parties or Members.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Jobling, that the invitation extended to Mr Ron Christie, Coordinator-General, to attend the hearing, be noted and confirmed.

The Hon Carl Scully MP, Minister for Transport and Minister for Roads, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisors:

Coordinator-General

Ron Christie, Coordinator-General

Department of Transport

Jock Murray, Director General Paul Hayes, Director – Policy Arthur Rogers, Senior Manager Policy Coordination Stephen Fox, Director Service Funding Kevin Robinson, Program Manager Program Management John Cassar, Assistant Director Finance

State Rail Authority

Simon Lane, Chief Executive Officer Rob Noyes, Chief Financial Officer

Rail Access Corporation

John Cowling, Chief Executive Officer Simon Foster, Manager Corporate Relations

Rail Services Australia

Terry Ogg, Chief Executive Officer

Roads and Traffic Authority

Paul Forward, Chief Executive Officer Sue Sinclair, Director Road Safety and Road User Management Mike Hannon, Director Road Network Infrastructure Chris Ford, Director Traffic and Transport Peter Scarlett, Director Finance Jay Stricker, General Manager Environment and Community Policy

Waterways Authority

Matt Taylor, Chief Executive Officer Ken Bywater, Finance Manager – Waterways Authority Brian Stanwell, Finance Manager – Marine Ministerial Holding Company

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Transport and Roads open for examination.

The Minister and relevant advisors answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Transport and Roads concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public and media withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Jobling, that an additional hearing date for the portfolio areas of Transport and Roads be decided at the next meeting.

Resolved, on the motion Mr Jobling, that any additional written questions relating to the portfolio areas of Transport and Roads be lodged with the Director of the General Purpose Standing Committees within 24 hours of the hearing.

4. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10.10 pm until 3.30pm on Friday 9 June 2000.

Friday 9 June 2000 At Parliament House at 3.30 pm

1. Members Present

Ms Gardiner (in the Chair) Ms Burnswoods (Macdonald) Mr Cohen Mr Hatzistergos Mr Johnson (Saffin) Mr Lynn

2. Apologies

Mr Oldfield

3. Budget Estimates reference

The Chair advised that Ms Burnswoods would be representing Mr Macdonald, and Mr Johnson would be representing Ms Saffin.

The Chair announced that the Minister would not be attending due to illness, but would be represented by the Director General of the Department of Public Works and Services, Mr Dick Persson.

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings

The Committee deliberated.

The Committee agreed not to allocate specific blocks of time for questioning.

Mr Dick Persson, Director General, Public Works and Services, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisors:

Department of Public Works and Services

Adrian Renouf, Director, Executive Services Division Ken Page, Acting Manager, Corporate Finance Tony Collins, Group General Manager, Project Management Group David Lewis, Group General Manager, Corporate and Business Services Group Ted Smithies, Director, Policy Services Division Ian McFarlane, Cost Centre Manager, Country, State Valuation Office Ted Smith, Manager, Ministerial and Executive Support Unit.

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Public Works and Services open for examination.

Mr Persson and relevant advisors answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Public Works and Services concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public and media withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that any additional written questions relating to the portfolio area of Public Works and Services be lodged with the Director of the General Purpose Standing Committees by Thursday 15 June 2000.

The Committee deliberated.

The Committee agreed that the clerk to the Committee liaise with the Treasurer's office and Members of the Committee to find a suitable time for an additional hearing for Transport and Roads, given that the time indicated to the Committee, Wednesday 14 June 2000 from 4.00 pm to 6.00 pm, is not suitable.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Cohen, that the Committee hold an additional hearing for the portfolio areas of Gaming and Racing.

The Committee agreed that if Members have any specific issues which they wish to be addressed in the report they should notify the clerk of those issues by Friday 16 June 2000.

The Committee agreed that at its next meeting it would consider a date for consideration of the draft report.

4. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 4.45 pm sine die.

Monday 19 June 2000 At Parliament House at 10.00 am

1. Members Present

Ms Gardiner (in the Chair) Mr Cohen Mr Dyer (Macdonald) Mr Johnson (Saffin) Mr Primrose (Hatzistergos) Dr Pezzutti (Lynn)

2. Apologies

Mr Oldfield

3. Budget Estimates reference

The following witnesses were admitted:

Department of Gaming and Racing

Mr Ken Brown, Director-General. Mr Michael Foggo, Director, Revenue and Resource Management

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Gaming and Racing open for examination.

Mr Brown and Mr Foggo answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Dr Pezzutti tabled a letter dated 16 June 2000 from the Minister's office concerning availability of witnesses for the hearing.

The witnesses continued to answer questions by Members of the Committee.

Mr Foggo tendered a document in support of his evidence.

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Pezzutti, that the Committee accepts the document.

The witnesses continued to answer questions by Members of the Committee.

The examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Gaming and Racing concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public and media withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Pezzutti, that, under section 4 of the *Parliamentary Papers* (*Supplementary Provisions*) *Act 1975* and under the authority of Standing Order 252, the Committee authorises the Clerk of the Committee to publish the documents tabled..

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Pezzutti, that:

- (a) the Director of Casino Surveillance, the Chief Executive of the Casino Control Authority, and the Chairperson of the Authority, be invited to attend and give evidence at a supplementary hearing to be held on a date to be determined;
- (b) the proposed witnesses be requested to advise the Committee whether or not they will attend, within a reasonable period before the supplementary hearing date;
- (c) if any of the proposed witnesses indicates that he or she will not attend, the Chair issue a summons requiring that witness to attend and give evidence.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Dr Pezzutti, that the Committee consider the draft report at a meeting to be convened for either Wednesday 21 or Thursday 22 June 2000 at a time to be arranged by the Secretariat in consultation with Members.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Cohen, that the Committee accept the draft minutes previously circulated, relating to the meetings of the Committee held on 6, 7 and 9 June 2000.

4. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 12.20 pm until 2.00pm on Monday 19 June 2000.

Monday 19 June 2000 At Parliament House at 2.00 pm

1. Members Present

Ms Gardiner (in the Chair) Mr Cohen Mr Hatzistergos Mr Jobling (Lynn) Mr Primrose (Macdonald)

2. Apologies

Mr Oldfield Ms Saffin

3. Budget Estimates 2000-2001

The Chair advised that Mr Jobling would be representing Mr Lynn and Mr Primrose would be representing Mr Macdonald.

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Committee deliberated.

The Committee agreed that, as a general guide, questions would be asked as follows: Rail – 45 minutes; Roads – 45 minutes; Ports – remaining time.

Mr Ron Christie, Coordinator-General, Mr Paul Forward, Chief Executive Officer, Roads and Traffic Authority, and Mr Matthew Taylor, Chief Executive Officer, Waterways Authority, were admitted and accompanied by the following advisors:

Department of Transport

Mr Paul Hayes, Acting Deputy Director General.

Roads and Traffic Authority

Mr Peter Scarlett, Director, Finance.

Waterways Authority

Mr Ken Bywater, Finance Manager

Marine Ministerial Holding Company

Mr Brian Stanwell

Ministerial Advisers

Lisa Hunt, Chief of Staff Vish Beri, Senior Policy Advisor Liz McNamara, Senior Policy Advisor Sean Kennedy, Senior Policy Advisor Simon Carroll, Policy Advisor

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Transport and Roads open for examination.

Mr Christie, Mr Forward, Mr Taylor, and advisors answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Transport and Roads concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public and media withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Jobling, that any additional questions relating to the portfolio areas of Transport and Roads be lodged with the Director of the General Purpose Standing Committees by 5.00 pm, Thursday 22 June 2000.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Cohen, that the Committee hold a deliberative meeting to consider the draft report on Thursday 22 June 2000 from 9.00 am to 9.30 am.

4. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 4.07 pm until 9.00 am on Thursday, 22 June 2000.

Thursday 22 June 2000 At Parliament House at 9.00 am

1. Members Present

Ms Gardiner (in the Chair) Mr Cohen Mr Burnswoods (Saffin) Mr Hatzistergos Mr Lynn (from 9.10am) Mr Oldfield Dr Pezzutti (Lynn) (until 9.10am)

2. Apologies

Mr Macdonald

3. Confirmation of minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Cohen, that the minutes of meetings no $11 \mbox{ and } 12 \mbox{ be confirmed}$

4. Budget Estimates 2000-2001

The Chair advised that Dr Pezzutti would be representing Mr Lynn and Ms Burnswoods would be representing Ms Saffin.

The Chair submitted her draft report entitled "Budget Estimates 2000-2001, Volume 1", which having been circulated to each Member of the Committee, was accepted as being read.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that paragraph 2.19 be amended by deleting the title "Witnesses in attendance" and inserting instead the title "Casino Surveillance and Casino Control Authority witnesses"; replacing the words "noted the absence" to "discussed the need to call"; and deleting the sentence "The Chair indicated the Committee would consider the need to call additional persons before the Committee at a later date."

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that paragraph 2.12 be amended by inserting at the end of the paragraph the words "particularly with reference to the proposed ban on the cashing of cheques at hotels."

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that paragraph 2.16 be amended by inserting after the word "recommendation" the words "that the Director of Casino Surveillance move to a risk-based monitoring program".

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that paragraph 2.21 be amended by deleting the words "has a responsibility" and inserting instead the words "is required, by virtue of the casino licence".

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that paragraph 2.22 be amended by inserting in the first sentence the words "section 31" before the word "inquiry"; and by deleting at the end of the second sentence the words "inquiry process" and instead inserting the words "inquiries being conducted under sections. 31 and 143".

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that chapter 2 be amended by inserting a new section under paragraph 2.26 entitled "Inspectors as witnesses" and that the following text be inserted under the title "The Chair questioned Mr Brown as to whether he would have difficulty were the Committee to select a batch of inspectors to appear before it. Mr Brown stated he had no objection and acknowledged he had no power to object."

Mr Lynn moved: that chapter 2 be amended by inserting a new section at the end of the chapter entitled "Gaming and Liquor Commission" and that the following text be inserted under the title "The Committee noted that on 22 September 1999 the Minister stated that a report would be delivered to Cabinet from a whole-of-government committee regarding the establishment of a Gaming and Liquor Commission. Mr Brown was unable to provide information on progress in this matter."

Debate ensued.

Mr Hatzistergos moved: that the amendment of Mr Lynn be amended by deleting the words "was unable to provide information on progress in this matter" and inserting instead "said this was a matter of government policy and was under the auspices of the Premier. He suggested questions about progress in relation to the matter be directed to the Premier."

Question: that the amendment of Mr Hatzistergos be agreed to – put and passed.

Original question – as amended – put and passed.

Consideration of the Chair's draft report suspended.

The Committee deliberated.

Mr Lynn moved: that:

- 1. the Committee hold a supplementary hearing in relation to the Gaming and Racing portfolio from 10am to 4pm on either Friday 11 August 2000 or Monday 14 August 2000; and
- 2. the Director of Casino Surveillance, the Chief Executive and Chairperson of the Casino Control Authority, and a number of inspectors appointed under the *Casino Control Authority Act 1992* (whom the Chair of the Committee is given discretion to select), be requested to attend the hearing.

Debate ensued.

Question put.

Ayes: Ms Gardiner Mr Cohen Mr Lynn Mr Oldfield

Nos: Ms Burnswoods Mr Hatzistergos

Question resolved in the affirmative.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that the Chair write to the Minister for Gaming and Racing advising the Minister of the Committee's decision to hold a supplementary hearing on either 11 August or 14 August 2000, at which the Director of Casino Surveillance, the Chief Executive and Chairperson of the Casino Control Authority, and a number of inspectors appointed under the Casino Control Authority Act 1992 will be invited to attend, and seek written advice from the Minister, by a specified date, as to the availability of these persons to attend on the nominated days.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Hatzistergos, that the Chair seek advice from the Minister about the impact of secrecy provisions of the *Casino Control Authority Act 1992* on the ability of witnesses to answer questions before the Committee at a public hearing; and ensure that inspectors called to appear before the Committee attend during periods when they are not rostered on standard surveillance operations.

The Chair advised the Committee she would seek advice from the Clerk of the Parliaments about whether legislative provisions impact on the powers of a Committee to question witnesses.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Ms Burnswoods, that future reports on the Budget Estimates place greater emphasis on responses from witnesses, as opposed to questions asked by Members.

Consideration of the Chair's draft report resumed.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that the report, as amended, be adopted.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that the report be signed by the Chairman and presented to the House in accordance with the resolution referring the Budget Estimates.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that the documents received in relation to the inquiry be tabled with the report and made public.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that 5pm on Friday 21 July 2000 be the date by which Ministers are requested to respond to questions placed on notice in relation to each of the portfolios examined by the Committee, and that answers received be made available to Members of the Committee by 5pm on Monday 24 July 2000.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Lynn, that pursuant to the provisions of section 4 of the Parliamentary Papers (Supplementary Provisions) Act 1975 and under the authority of Standing Order 252, the Committee authorises the Clerk of the Committee to publish the answers provided to questions placed on notice, after these answers have been circulated to Committee Members.

5. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 9.58 am until the 10am on the day of the Gaming and Racing supplementary hearing (either 11 or 14 August 2000).